



Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board
Tuesday, September 22, 2020 at 7:00PM
Virtual Meeting

Meeting Minutes/Legal Action Report

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Members Present: Michael Bell, Elaine Hill, Chris Jech, Carol Maywood, Colleen Sackheim.

City Staff Present: Jodie Brown, Michael Taku

Guests Present: Jennifer DeBenedetti, Nina Hernandez, Matt Kim, Natatsha Kim, Angie Kim, Mary Lou Nuttall.

A quorum was established, and the meeting was called to order at 7:00PM.

2. Approval of Minutes: August 25, 2020

a. Sackheim: indicated that in item 5, 3rd sentence the name should be spelled "Pope," rather than "Poe" as written, and in the following (4th) sentence, "She" should be replaced with "Sackheim."

b. Maywood indicated that item 6.a states that the minor review was completed on 8-21-2020 but does not state that the screen door in question was approved, as was reported at the meeting.

c. Approval of Minutes as amended was moved by Bell and Seconded by Jech. Passed 5/0.

3. Reviews

a. HPZ 20-043, 3231 N. Craycroft Road

Construction freestanding covered patio area with concrete benches.

Full Review/Non-Contributing Property

DeBenedetti, fifth grade teacher at The Gregory School introduced the project and noted that return of students to in-person school will be facilitated by the use of the proposed structure for outdoor learning. Kim presented the plans.

Discussion points included dimensions and screening, coated metal roof, painted metal posts and beams. The slab and concrete seats have already been poured. There are plans to coat the concrete with polyurea in colors of desert tan and mesquite brown. The drawing provided shows metal posts installed on the slab, but the applicant stated that the posts would be outside the slab.

The Board supports the Schools efforts to provide outdoor learning spaces. Concerns expressed by board members about the design of the structure included:

- height of the roof appears to be within inches of the limit of 16' limit for the

historic zone; clarification is needed of whether the height is measured at grade or on the slab

- peaked, rather than flat roof, polyurea coated metal instead of exposed metal roof which is seen in many other structures in the Zone
- painted rather than rusticated metal posts; was there consideration of a stone veneer on the posts similar to structures at Fort Lowell Park
- concerns about the visibility of the large structure from the neighborhood to the south
- concern about setting a precedent for future non-conforming projects, including future outdoor classrooms/ramadas at the school itself
- slab has been installed over a water easement
- applicant did research other structures at Fort Lowell Park but members did not see them reflected in design modifications

Hernandez described limitations that influenced the compromises employed, including costs.

Although not included with the plans as presented here, the applicant stated that additional planning has been underway for planting of native vegetation to surround the structure and mask its structural details. Plans presented appear to have not significantly changed since the preliminary meeting in February, having failed to incorporate suggestions proposed to bring the project into closer compliance with design standards for the Historic Zone.

Motion made by Hill, seconded by Bell: In second consideration of this project, the structure has an industrial rather than residential appearance, and does not contribute to the historic character of this Historic Zone. The colors are appropriate, but the coatings and painting are not consistent in regard to recommendations for rusticated metal, standing seam metal roofing, profile; and plans for surrounding landscaping masking the structure are yet to be presented. This will not be a precedent model for future architectural plans if there will be other structures built in the zone. The motion passed 3/2. No recommendation was made as to approval or disapproval of this project. The proposal will next be submitted to the Plans Review Subcommittee, Tucson-Pima Historical Commission.

4. Butterfly and Moth Book

a. Discussion on payment for book illustrations

Discussion on payment for book illustrations: Bell recommended that a pro forma be developed requesting illustration for both the cover, and the number of internal pages needed, and ask the price to be charged for each.

5. Minor Review Update

a. Updates on recent Minor Reviews provided

None.

6. Call to the Audience

7. Staff Updates

- Mary Lou Nuttal's term has expired; if she wishes to continue to attend meetings, she may be invited to discuss topics but will not vote on motions
- The Corbett Ditch was discussed as a possible historic landscape element in Sept 2016. Pursuit of historic status on private property would have to be through rezoning or National Register nomination.
- Compliance with TMC's PAD conditions was researched. TMC has recently committed to rehabilitation of the Arizona Building, but has not announced a timeline
- Fort Lowell flagpole question should be referred to private party who donated the flagpole
- Jech permit from 2018 follow-up is not required; the conditions of approval related to future projects that are not yet planned.

8. Future Agenda Items

None.

8. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 9:00PM.